

STATE OF NEW YORK
COUNTY OF DUTCHESS

-----X
DUTCHESS COUNTY INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT
AGENCY RE:

39 EASTDALE AVENUE - 2H

-----X

DATE: November 10, 2020
10:01 a.m. - 10:13 a.m.

Frances M. Elmes, Reporter

MINUTES OF PUBLIC HEARING
CONDUCTED BY REMOTE VIDEOCONFERENCE

MARY T. BABIARZ COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.
(845) 471-2511

1 APPEARING BY REMOTE VIDEO CONFERENCE:

2 DONALD CAPPILLINO, Hearing Officer
3 CAPPILLINO & ROTHSCHILD, LLP
4 Seven Broad Street
5 P.O. Box 390
6 Pawling, New York 12564
7 E-mail: Dc@cappillino.com

8 SARAH LEE, CFO, Think Dutchess Alliance
9 for Business
10 3 Neptune Avenue
11 Poughkeepsie, New York 12601
12 E-mail: Sarah@thinkdutchess.com

13 JOSEPH KIRCHOFF

14 JOHN HETTINGER

15 CATHERINE DURLAND

16 DOREEN TIGNANELLI

17 JAMES BERETTA

18 LYNN VARUZZO

19 DANIEL MOORE

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 Proceedings

2 MR. CAPPILLINO: First of all,
3 before this public hearing began we sent
4 to the court reporter documents that I
5 have marked into evidence indicating,
6 number one, that this public hearing was
7 scheduled for --- the Notice of Public
8 Hearing said it was open at 10 a.m., the
9 invite. We were open as of 9:30, so I
10 think there's no harm done with that and
11 people have hung around. And I
12 apologize for those of you who came in
13 at 9:30 and had to wait a half hour
14 before we opened this, but I see it
15 looks like everybody is here that was
16 here and I want to continue this, if I
17 may.

18 Next, so beginning this, going
19 through the documents, the first
20 document I had marked in evidence is the
21 Notice of Public Hearing as Hearing
22 Officer's Exhibit Number 1 indicating
23 that this public hearing be held by Zoom
24 conference on November 10, 2020 at
25 10 a.m. We're now conducting that

1 Proceedings

2 hearing. Number 2 in evidence is the
3 Affidavit of Publication from the
4 Poughkeepsie Journal indicating that on
5 October 27th this Notice of Public
6 Hearing was published in the
7 Poughkeepsie Journal.

8 I have marked as Hearing
9 Officer'S Exhibit Number 3 in evidence
10 the affidavit of Jenna L. Jones
11 indicating that on October 26th a copy
12 of this public hearing was served upon
13 the Honorable John J. Baisley,
14 Supervisor of the Town of Poughkeepsie;
15 Dr. Brendan Lyons, Superintendent of
16 Schools of the Arlington Central School
17 District; and Honorable Marcus J.
18 Molinaro, Dutchess County Executive.

19 I had marked as Hearing Officer's
20 Exhibit Number 4 the October 22, 2020
21 letter of Timothy Dean, Chairman of the
22 Dutchess County Industrial Development
23 Agency, authorizing me to conduct this
24 public hearing.

25 And so with that I will now open

1 Proceedings

2 this public hearing for comments of the
3 public. Before we begin, I don't know
4 if the applicant wants to make a short
5 statement. John Hettinger, do you want
6 to speak? Can someone un-mute John?
7 Are you un-muted? John, you're still
8 muted. John, can you be un-muted?

9 MS. LEE: He is un-muted on our
10 side, he's muted on his side.

11 MR. CAPPILLINO: On your side,
12 John. Now?

13 MR. KIRCHOFF: We have a lot of
14 technical difficulties today, Don. Hold
15 on.

16 MR. CAPPILLINO: They're
17 switching offices.

18 MR. KIRCHOFF: Hey, Don?

19 MR. CAPPILLINO: Yes?

20 MR. KIRCHOFF: It looks like
21 someone on your end has John muted on
22 his phone. He calls in and you've got
23 him muted on your end.

24 MR. CAPPILLINO: Got it. All
25 right. Is Rachel on? Can Rachel take

1 Proceedings

2 care of this, Sarah?

3 MR. KIRCHOFF: Sarah, you're
4 muted, too.

5 MS. LEE: He's taken care of now.

6 MR. KIRCHOFF: We got it.

7 MR. HETTINGER: It's a much
8 better sound quality from my phone, so I
9 couldn't actually un-mute it, that was
10 done for me.

11 MR. CAPPILLINO: All right.
12 Okay.

13 MR. HETTINGER: Should we start?
14 Is it okay? Can we go now?

15 MR. CAPPILLINO: Yeah.

16 MR. HETTINGER: Well, thank you,
17 everybody, obviously for hosting and
18 coordinating this public hearing.
19 Eastdale is obviously thrilled to be
20 back in front of the IDA, in front of
21 the public presenting another project.
22 Obviously we have a lot of great work
23 going on right now, both on the
24 residential side and also on the
25 commercial main street.

1 Proceedings

2 45 Eastdale Avenue North is
3 coming out of the ground. We've broken
4 ground on the future home of Rossi's, as
5 well, and we're working through Eastdale
6 Residential 2, the second residential
7 phase comprising of 88-units.

8 The project we're discussing
9 today will be owned and operated by 39
10 Eastdale Avenue, LLC. It would
11 represent an allocation of benefits
12 previously conferred upon MHTC
13 Development to 39 Eastdale Avenue. If I
14 can share my screen here shortly. Can
15 everybody see this screen?

16 MR. CAPPILLINO: Yup.

17 MR. HETTINGER: Great. So 39
18 Eastdale Avenue is a 2,176 square foot
19 mixed use office and residential
20 building located on the northwest side
21 of Route 44. The project is prominently
22 located along Eastdale Avenue North
23 adjacent to other commercial uses.

24 The project architecture reflects
25 the traditional attractive architecture

1 Proceedings

2 Durland to say a few comments about the
3 project.

4 MS. DURLAND: Hey, good morning.
5 Can you all hear me?

6 MR. CAPPILLINO: Yes, we can.

7 MS. DURLAND: All right. Very
8 good. It's so good to see some familiar
9 faces and some new faces. As John
10 mentioned, I'm Catherine Durland. I
11 have a little bit about me, I've been
12 born and raised here in Dutchess County.
13 My family has been here for over five
14 generations and today my husband and I
15 are raising our two boys on that family
16 farm.

17 So what that farm provided for
18 me, I came to live and understand the
19 hard work, perseverances and challenges
20 of owning, operating and growing a small
21 business. So this year I am starting my
22 own business, it's going to be Catherine
23 Durland Insurance and Financial Services
24 under the umbrella of State Farm. And
25 my vision for it as a small business is

1 Proceedings

2 employing my first year three team
3 members and myself and then growing it
4 as the business grows.

5 I immediately was attracted to
6 State Farm or to Eastdale, the property,
7 just because of the mixed use of
8 commercial and residential and the
9 live/work kind of community that is
10 situated there. And I'm so fortunate
11 for State Farm for believing in me and
12 they very much are --- understand the
13 value of, you know, a brick and mortar
14 business in the community.

15 So at this time I come here
16 before you at this public hearing to ---
17 you know, without the support and the
18 partnership of MHTC and the IDA to move
19 forward with, you know, making this a
20 permanent place for me and my business
21 to grow.

22 MR. CAPPILLINO: Okay. Thank
23 you. I appreciate it. Now, if anyone,
24 members of the public want to speak
25 about this project. I do note that we

1 Proceedings

2 did receive e-mails from Doreen
3 Tignanelli and James --- I'm sorry, last
4 name, what's his last name?

5 MR. BERETTA: Beretta.

6 MR. CAPPILLINO: Beretta. I'm
7 sorry, Jim.

8 MR. BERETTA: No problem.

9 MR. CAPPILLINO: We did receive
10 those and they will be passed on to the
11 board along with a transcript of this
12 public hearing. Frances will provide
13 that this afternoon and we'll send it on
14 to the board, so it's already been
15 ordered and we'll make sure that they
16 get a chance to see that. Is there
17 anything beyond those comments that, Jim
18 or Doreen, you want to add to this
19 public hearing?

20 MR. BERETTA: Yeah, this is Jim,
21 since I'm un-muted let me just go. So,
22 yeah, okay. So you have my public
23 comments. I'm opposed to the financial
24 assistance that's being requested here.
25 There's only one FTE. You know, there

1 Proceedings

2 isn't any evident business case. You
3 know, the public can dig and scratch and
4 request and ask all we want but there's
5 never any business case that's evident.

6 It's basically --- it's a
7 transfer of tax burden and, you know, on
8 top of that we're in the middle of a
9 pandemic when people are --- you know,
10 are unemployed, massive unemployment.
11 We have problems right here in the
12 county, it's been documented in
13 newspaper articles. Dutchess County,
14 you know, has a tremendous loss of sales
15 revenue.

16 You know, people on the inside
17 have told me that, you know, that
18 there's a --- you know, that there's a
19 big gap and we're probably going to see
20 even more as time goes on. So for all
21 of those reasons I'm opposed to granting
22 of the financial assistance. Thank you.

23 MR. CAPPILLINO: All right.

24 Thank you, Jim. Doreen?

25 MS. TIGNANELLI: Thank you,

1 Proceedings

2 Mr. Cappillino. Yes, I'm also opposed
3 to the issuance of any financial
4 assistance to the 39 Eastdale Avenue
5 project. As I've stated before, it
6 seems highly unlikely that the applicant
7 and the associated family trust or
8 family entities that were outlined in
9 the original and updated application
10 couldn't absorb the sales tax exemption
11 and mortgage tax exemptions for this
12 project.

13 And also the application states
14 one FTE, but if I caught what
15 Ms. Durland said correctly, I believe
16 she said three plus herself. So, if
17 that's the case, then the application is
18 incorrect. And that should be corrected
19 if that's the case because you're
20 supposed to be holding people
21 accountable for the number of jobs they
22 claim they are providing.

23 And the last thing, Mr. Hettinger
24 says he's thrilled to be here and, well,
25 I'm guessing he would be thrilled to be

1 Proceedings

2 here because every time he comes before
3 the IDA he seems to get more money from
4 them, so...

5 MR. CAPPILLINO: Just to clarify,
6 this is an allocation of already
7 approved benefits to different sections
8 of the entire development as it goes
9 through. So, okay, but go ahead, I'm
10 sorry.

11 MS. TIGNANELLI: No, that's okay.
12 But, anyway, those are my comments. And
13 again, about the FTE, that should be
14 cleared up. Thank you.

15 MR. CAPPILLINO: All right.
16 Thank you very much. Is there anyone
17 else that wants to be heard?

18
19 (NO RESPONSE)

20
21 MR. CAPPILLINO: Okay. It is now
22 10 --- almost 10:14 and I will now close
23 the public hearing. Thank you very
24 much.

25 * * * *

1 STATE OF NEW YORK)
2) SS.
3 COUNTY OF DUTCHESS)
4

5 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION
6

7 I hereby certify that the foregoing is
8 a true and accurate transcript of the minutes
9 recorded by me and reduced to typewriting at
10 my direction.
11

12
13 *Frances M. Elmes*
14 X _____
FRANCES M. ELMES
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

	authorizing (1) 4:23		3:24	6:19;7:2,5,10,13, 18,22;8:12,23;10:6; 13:4
A	Avenue (6) 7:2,10,13,18,22; 13:4	C	conferred (1) 7:12	Eastdale's (1) 8:2
absorb (1) 13:10		calls (1) 5:22	consistent (2) 8:22,24	element (1) 8:6
accountable (1) 13:21	B	came (2) 3:12;9:18	construct (1) 8:13	else (1) 14:17
actually (1) 6:9	back (1) 6:20	Can (9) 5:6,8,25;6:14;7:14, 14;9:5,6;12:3	continue (1) 3:16	e-mails (1) 11:2
add (1) 11:18	Baisley (1) 4:13	CAPPILLINO (17) 3:2;5:11,16,19,24; 6:11,15;7:16;9:6; 10:22;11:6,9;12:23; 13:2;14:5,15,21	coordinating (1) 6:18	employing (1) 10:2
adjacent (1) 7:23	based (1) 8:16	care (2) 6:2,5	copy (1) 4:11	end (2) 5:21,23
Affidavit (2) 4:3,10	basically (1) 12:6	case (4) 12:2,5;13:17,19	corrected (1) 13:18	enthusiasm (1) 8:17
afternoon (1) 11:13	befitting (1) 8:2	Catherine (3) 8:25;9:10,22	correctly (1) 13:15	entire (1) 14:8
again (1) 14:13	began (1) 3:3	caught (1) 13:14	County (5) 4:18,22;9:12; 12:12,13	entities (1) 13:8
against (1) 8:8	begin (1) 5:3	Center (1) 8:15	court (1) 3:4	even (1) 12:20
Agency (1) 4:23	beginning (1) 3:18	Central (1) 4:16	D	everybody (3) 3:15;6:17;7:15
ahead (1) 14:9	believing (1) 10:11	certifiedsic (1) 8:4	Dean (1) 4:21	evidence (4) 3:5,20;4:2,9
aim (1) 8:14	benefits (2) 7:11;14:7	Chairman (1) 4:21	Development (4) 4:22;7:13;8:12; 14:8	evident (2) 12:2,5
allocation (2) 7:11;14:6	Beretta (5) 11:5,5,6,8,20	challenges (1) 9:19	different (1) 14:7	Executive (1) 4:18
almost (1) 14:22	better (1) 6:8	championed (1) 8:13	difficulties (1) 5:14	exemption (1) 13:10
along (2) 7:22;11:11	beyond (1) 11:17	chance (1) 11:16	dig (1) 12:3	exemptions (1) 13:11
apartment (1) 8:5	big (1) 12:19	claim (1) 13:22	discussing (1) 7:8	Exhibit (3) 3:22;4:9,20
apologize (1) 3:12	bit (1) 9:11	clarify (1) 14:5	District (1) 4:17	extremely (1) 8:8
applicant (2) 5:4;13:6	board (3) 8:11;11:11,14	cleared (1) 14:14	document (1) 3:20	F
application (3) 13:9,13,17	born (1) 9:12	close (1) 14:22	documented (1) 12:12	facade (1) 8:9
appreciate (1) 10:23	both (1) 6:23	coming (1) 7:3	documents (2) 3:4,19	faces (2) 9:9,9
approach (1) 8:19	boys (1) 9:15	comments (5) 5:2;9:2;11:17,23; 14:12	Don (2) 5:14,18	familiar (1) 9:8
approved (1) 14:7	Brendan (1) 4:15	commercial (3) 6:25;7:23;10:8	done (2) 3:10;6:10	family (5) 8:21;9:13,15;13:7, 8
architecture (2) 7:24,25	brick (2) 8:8;10:13	commitment (1) 8:18	Doreen (3) 11:2,18;12:24	farm (5) 9:16,17,24;10:6,11
Arlington (1) 4:16	brilliant (1) 8:3	community (2) 10:9,14	Dr (1) 4:15	few (1) 9:2
around (1) 3:11	bring (1) 8:6	comprising (1) 7:7	Durland (7) 8:21;9:2,4,7,10,23; 13:15	Financial (4) 9:23;11:23;12:22; 13:3
articles (1) 12:13	broken (1) 7:3	conduct (1) 4:23	Dutchess (4) 4:18,22;9:12;12:13	First (4) 3:2,19;8:3;10:2
assistance (3) 11:24;12:22;13:4	building (1) 7:20	conducting (1) 3:25	E	five (1) 9:13
associated (1) 13:7	burden (1) 12:7	conference (1)	Eastdale (11)	floor (2)
attracted (1) 10:5	business (8) 9:21,22,25;10:4,14, 20;12:2,5			
attractive (2) 7:25;8:8				

8:3,5 foot (1) 7:18 fortunate (1) 10:10 forward (1) 10:19 Frances (1) 11:12 front (2) 6:20,20 FTE (3) 11:25;13:14;14:13 further (1) 8:14 future (1) 7:4	14:23 hearings (1) 8:11 held (1) 3:23 herself (1) 13:16 Hettinger (6) 5:5;6:7,13,16;7:17; 13:23 Hey (2) 5:18;9:4 highly (1) 13:6 Hold (1) 5:14 holding (1) 13:20 home (1) 7:4 Honorable (2) 4:13,17 hosting (1) 6:17 hour (1) 3:13 hung (1) 3:11 husband (1) 9:14	Jim (4) 11:7,17,20;12:24 jobs (1) 13:21 John (8) 4:13;5:5,6,7,8,12, 21;9:9 Jones (1) 4:10 Journal (2) 4:4,7	12:10 may (1) 3:17 meetings (1) 8:11 members (2) 10:3,24 mentioned (1) 9:10 MHTC (3) 7:12;8:11;10:18 middle (1) 12:8 mission (1) 8:24 mixed (2) 7:19;10:7 Molinaro (1) 4:18 money (1) 14:3 more (2) 12:20;14:3 morning (1) 9:4 mortar (1) 10:13 mortgage (1) 13:11 move (1) 10:18 much (5) 6:7;8:16;10:12; 14:16,24 muted (5) 5:8,10,21,23;6:4 myself (1) 10:3	13:21
G		K		O
gap (1) 12:19 generations (1) 9:14 glass (1) 8:4 goes (2) 12:20;14:8 good (3) 9:4,8,8 granting (1) 12:21 great (2) 6:22;7:17 ground (2) 7:3,4 grow (1) 10:21 growing (2) 9:20;10:3 grows (1) 10:4 guessing (1) 13:25	I	L		obviously (3) 6:17,19,22 October (3) 4:5,11,20 office (1) 7:19 Officer's (3) 3:22;4:9,19 offices (1) 5:17 one (3) 3:6;11:25;13:14 only (1) 11:25 open (3) 3:8,9;4:25 opened (1) 3:14 operated (1) 7:9 operating (1) 9:20 opposed (3) 11:23;12:21;13:2 ordered (1) 11:15 original (1) 13:9 out (1) 7:3 outlined (1) 13:8 over (2) 8:25;9:13 overall (2) 8:17,22 own (1) 9:22 owned (2) 7:9;8:21 owner/operator (1) 8:13 owner/operators (1) 8:15 owning (1) 9:20
H	IDA (4) 6:20;8:24;10:18; 14:3 immediately (1) 10:5 incorrect (1) 13:18 indicating (4) 3:5,22;4:4,11 Industrial (1) 4:22 inside (1) 12:16 Insurance (1) 9:23 intent (1) 8:22 into (2) 3:5;8:7 invite (1) 3:9 issuance (1) 13:3	last (3) 11:3,4;13:23 LEE (2) 5:9;6:5 letter (1) 4:21 light (1) 8:7 little (1) 9:11 live (1) 9:18 live/work (1) 10:9 LLC (1) 7:10 located (2) 7:20,22 looks (2) 3:15;5:20 loss (1) 12:14 lot (2) 5:13;6:22 lots (1) 8:7 Lyons (1) 4:15	N	
half (1) 3:13 hard (1) 9:19 Harding (1) 8:4 harm (1) 3:10 hear (1) 9:5 heard (1) 14:17 hearing (18) 3:3,6,8,21,21,23; 4:2,6,8,12,19,24;5:2; 6:18;10:16;11:12,19;	J	M	N	
	James (2) 8:4;11:3 Jenna (1) 4:10	main (2) 6:25;8:2 majority (1) 8:20 making (1) 10:19 Marcus (1) 4:17 marked (4) 3:5,20;4:8,19 massive (1)	name (2) 11:4,4 natural (1) 8:7 new (1) 9:9 newspaper (1) 12:13 Next (1) 3:18 North (2) 7:2,22 northwest (1) 7:20 note (1) 10:25 Notice (3) 3:7,21;4:5 November (1) 3:24 number (6) 3:6,22;4:2,9,20;	P
				pandemic (1) 12:9 parcel (1) 8:18 part (1) 8:18 partnership (1) 10:18 passed (1) 11:10

<p>people (4) 3:11;12:9,16;13:20 permanent (1) 10:20 perseverances (1) 9:19 phase (1) 7:7 phone (2) 5:22;6:8 place (1) 10:20 plan (1) 8:23 plus (1) 13:16 possible (1) 8:16 Poughkeepsie (3) 4:4,7,14 presenting (1) 6:21 previously (1) 7:12 prior (1) 8:10 probably (1) 12:19 problem (1) 11:8 problems (1) 12:11 Proceedings (12) 3:1;4:1;5:1;6:1; 7:1;8:1;9:1;10:1; 11:1;12:1;13:1;14:1 project (9) 6:21;7:8,21,24; 8:20;9:3;10:25;13:5, 12 prominent (1) 8:6 prominently (1) 7:21 property (1) 10:6 provide (1) 11:12 provided (1) 9:17 providing (1) 13:22 public (20) 3:3,6,7,21,23;4:5, 12,24;5:2,3;6:18,21; 8:10;10:16,24;11:12, 19,22;12:3;14:23 Publication (1) 4:3 published (1) 4:6</p>					
	Q	14:7 seems (2) 13:6;14:3 send (1) 11:13 sent (1) 3:3 served (1) 4:12 Services (1) 9:23 set (1) 8:7 share (1) 7:14 short (1) 5:4 shortly (1) 7:14 side (5) 5:10,10,11;6:24; 7:20 siding (1) 8:5 situated (1) 10:10 small (2) 9:20,25 someone (2) 5:6,21 sorry (3) 11:3,7;14:10 sound (1) 6:8 speak (2) 5:6;10:24 square (1) 7:18 start (1) 6:13 starting (1) 9:21 State (3) 9:24;10:6,11 stated (1) 13:5 statement (1) 5:5 states (1) 13:13 still (1) 5:7 street (2) 6:25;8:2 Superintendent (1) 4:15 Supervisor (1) 4:14 support (2) 8:14;10:17 supposed (1) 13:20 sure (1)	11:15 switching (1) 5:17	up (1) 14:14 updated (1) 13:9 upon (2) 4:12;7:12 use (2) 7:19;10:7 uses (1) 7:23	
	quality (1) 6:8		T		
	R		tax (3) 12:7;13:10,11 team (1) 10:2 technical (1) 5:14 three (2) 10:2;13:16 thrilled (3) 6:19;13:24,25 Tignanelli (3) 11:3;12:25;14:11 Timothy (1) 4:21 today (3) 5:14;7:9;9:14 told (1) 12:17 top (1) 12:8 Town (2) 4:14;8:15 traditional (1) 7:25 transcript (1) 11:11 transfer (1) 12:7 tremendous (1) 12:14 trust (1) 13:7 turn (1) 8:25 two (1) 9:15	value (1) 10:13 Village (1) 8:23 vision (1) 9:25	
	Rachel (2) 5:25,25 raised (1) 9:12 raising (1) 9:15 really (1) 8:12 reasons (1) 12:21 receive (2) 11:2,9 reflects (1) 7:24 reporter (1) 3:4 represent (1) 7:11 request (1) 12:4 requested (1) 11:24 residential (5) 6:24;7:6,6,19;10:8 RESPONSE (1) 14:19 revenue (1) 12:15 right (7) 5:25;6:11,23;9:7; 12:11,23;14:15 Rossi's (1) 7:4 Route (1) 7:21			V	
	S		U	W	
	sales (2) 12:14;13:10 Sarah (2) 6:2,3 scheduled (1) 3:7 School (1) 4:16 Schools (1) 4:16 scratch (1) 12:3 screen (2) 7:14,15 second (2) 7:6;8:5 sections (1)		umbrella (1) 9:24 under (1) 9:24 understand (2) 9:18;10:12 unemployed (1) 12:10 unemployment (1) 12:10 unit (1) 8:7 unlikely (1) 13:6 un-mute (2) 5:6;6:9 un-muted (4) 5:7,8,9;11:21	wait (1) 3:13 wants (2) 5:4;14:17 what's (1) 11:4 window (1) 8:6 within (1) 8:15 without (1) 10:17 work (2) 6:22;9:19 working (1) 7:5	
				Y	
				year (2) 9:21;10:2 Yup (1) 7:16	
				Z	
			Zoom (1) 3:23		
			1		
			1 (1) 3:22 10 (4) 3:8,24,25;14:22 10:14 (1) 14:22		
			2		
			2 (2)		

4:2;7:6 2,176 (1) 7:18 2020 (2) 3:24;4:20 22 (1) 4:20 26th (1) 4:11 27th (1) 4:5				
3				
3 (1) 4:9 39 (4) 7:9,13,17;13:4				
4				
4 (1) 4:20 44 (1) 7:21 45 (1) 7:2				
8				
88-units (1) 7:7				
9				
9:30 (2) 3:9,13				

Sarah Lee

From: Jim Beretta <jimberetta@aol.com>
Sent: Monday, November 09, 2020 6:29 PM
To: Sarah Lee
Subject: Public Hearing Comments, 39 Eastdale Avenue, LLC,

I wish to submit the following public comment for the November 10, 2020 DCIDA public hearing for the financial assistance request from MHTC Development, LLC and 39 Eastdale Avenue, LLC.

As per the meeting notice:

"MHTC DEVELOPMENT, LLC, a Delaware limited liability company authorized to do business in New York with offices at 199 West Road, Suite 101, Pleasant Valley, New York 12569 (the "Master Company"), submitted an application (the "Application") to the Agency for financial assistance to finance a project (the "Master Project") in connection with the construction, improvement, reconstruction, repair, renovation, installation, furnishing and equipping of a certain mixed use commercial facility (the "Master Facility") in eight phases, known as "Eastdale Village Town Center", which financial assistance was approved by resolution dated August 7, 2018."

I am opposed to the financial assistance requested for this project.

1. Per the letter from MHTC DEVELOPMENT LLC, dated October 13, 2020, the number of jobs to be created and or maintained is **only "1" (one) FTE**.
2. There is no business case provided that demonstrates that this project is not economically feasible without financial assistance.
3. When development projects don't pay their taxes the burden is shifted to other taxpayers. Especially during this time of the COVID-19 pandemic, governments and municipalities have gaps in their budgets and absolving some from paying taxes is antithetical to the gaps in municipal budgets and fairness for all other taxpayers.
4. Millions of people in the country are facing unemployment and the lack of ability to put food on the table for their family. All taxes should be collected from for-profit, non-tax-exempt projects.
6. Right here in the Hudson Valley, a recent article in the Poughkeepsie Journal pointed out that **"38% of Hudson Valley households struggle to make ends meet"**. I reference that article below:

Poughkeepsie Journal article by Ryan Santistvan, August 12, 2020.

"ALICE report shows 38% of Hudson Valley households struggle to make ends meet"

" Amid the COVID-19 pandemic, unemployment across the region and state has soared. But even before that, roughly 38% of Hudson Valley households and 45% of households across the state were not making enough money to cover their basic needs, according to the United Way of New York. And, those numbers were disproportionately higher when looking only at black and hispanic households.

7. Dutchess County is experiencing financial budget gaps due to the COVID-19 pandemic, having to furlough employees, offer early retirement and take other spending cuts to try and meet the financial challenge. The County can ill afford to be providing tax exemptions. As quoted in the following referenced article, Dutchess County is at the top of the list, "statewide", for sales tax loss, so far, in 2020 and the County Executive "was projecting 50% less revenue in sales tax this year amid the pandemic."

Rockland/Westchester Journal News, May 12, 2020, David McKay Wilson

"Dutchess County had the biggest year-to-year sales tax decline statewide in March, with a loss of 17%, as popular restaurants shifted to take-out, and tourists stayed home. April was even worse, with sales taxes revenue down 27%. For the first four months of 2020, Dutchess sales tax receipts are down \$4.5 million, or 7%. Last month, Dutchess County Executive Marc Molinaro said the county was projecting 50% less revenue in sales tax this year amid the pandemic. The restoration "I daresay, is going to last through the duration of 2020," he said. "

Again, I am opposed to the financial assistance being requested.

Jim Beretta
Poughkeepsie
845-392-6252

Sarah Lee

From: Doreen Tignanelli <doreentig@aol.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 10, 2020 8:25 AM
To: Sarah Lee
Subject: Public Comment, 39 Eastdale Avenue Project, DCIDA Public Hearing, Nov 10, 2020

Ms. Lee, please include my comments as part of the official public record for the 10:00 am November 10, 2020 DCIDA Public Hearing regarding MHTC Development, LLC and 39 Eastdale Avenue, LLC project and share these comments with the DCIDA Chair and Board members.

- 1)** I am opposed to the issuance of "Financial Assistance" to the 39 Eastdale Avenue Project in any form including, but not limited to, Mortgage Tax Exemption, Sales Tax Exemption and Payment in Lieu of Taxes (PILOT).
- 2)** The applicants continually seek financial assistance for the Eastdale project at the expense of taxpayers. It seems highly unlikely that the applicants and the associated family trusts and/or family entities outlined in the original and updated applications could not absorb the requested sales tax exemption and mortgage tax exemption for this project.
- 3)** The application states "1 FTE" but it is unclear if this is a new job or an existing job. If an existing job, there would be no job creation benefit from the granting of this financial assistance.

Doreen A. Tignanelli
29 Colburn Drive
Poughkeepsie NY 12603