

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATE OF NEW YORK

COUNTY OF DUTCHESS

-----X

DUTCHESS COUNTY INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY

PUBLIC HEARING

REGARDING

USEF TIORANDA, LLC

and

AMAZON.COM SERVICES, LLC

-----X

December 4, 2020
9:30 a.m. - 9:54 a.m.

Laura Evans, Reporter

BEFORE: DONALD CAPPILLINO, HEARING OFFICER

MINUTES OF PUBLIC HEARING

HELD REMOTELY VIA

VIDEO CONFERENCE

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PARTICIPANTS:

- John DiCola, Bluewater Property Group
- Bob Ryan
- Brad Griggs, Sr. Manager of Economic Development, Amazon
- Nicholas D'Alessandro, Supervisor, Town of East Fishkill
- Ryan Kelly, Bluewater Property Group
- Sarah Lee, CEO, Think Dutchess
- Justice McCray
- James Beretta
- Doreen Tignanelli
- Rebecca Edwards

HEARING OFFICER'S EXHIBITS
IN EVIDENCE

- | # | DESCRIPTION |
|---|--|
| 1 | Notice of Public Hearing |
| 2 | Affidavit of Publication in Poughkeepsie Journal |
| 3 | Affidavit of Jenna Jones |
| 4 | Hearing Officer designation letter |

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 THE HEARING OFFICER:

3 Good morning, everyone. I'm
4 Donald Cappillino. I'm the Hearing
5 Officer in this matter. I'm now opening
6 the public hearing.

7 Before the public hearing began, I
8 had marked as Hearing Officer's Exhibit 1
9 the notice of public hearing indicating
10 that this Zoom public hearing would be
11 held at 9:30 today. It is now 9:30.

12 I have marked as Hearing Officer's
13 Exhibit 2 in evidence the affidavit of
14 publication indicating that the notice of
15 public hearing was published in the
16 Poughkeepsie Journal on November 20,
17 2020.

18 I have marked as Hearing Officer's
19 Exhibit 3 in evidence the affidavit of
20 Jenna Jones, indicating that on
21 November 20th, a copy of the notice of
22 public hearing was served by mail upon
23 the Honorable Nicholas D'Alessandro, the
24 Town of East Fishkill Supervisor; upon
25 Dr. Jose Carrion, the Superintendent of

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 Schools of Wappingers Central School
3 District; and Dr. Dwight Bonk, the Acting
4 Superintendent of Schools of Wappingers
5 Central School District; and upon the
6 Honorable Marcus J. Molinaro, the
7 Dutchess County Executive.

8 I had marked as Hearing Officer's
9 Exhibit 4 the November 18, 2020 letter to
10 Timothy Dean, the Chairman of the
11 Dutchess County Industrial Development
12 Agency, designating me as the Hearing
13 Officer.

14 With that, I will open the public
15 hearing. Would the Applicant like to
16 make any initial statements before we
17 begin? Mr. DiCola, would you like to, or
18 Mr. Ryan, would you like to make an
19 initial statements?

20 MR. JOHN DiCOLA:

21 Yes. Good morning, everyone.
22 Thank you for holding this public hearing
23 for this matter. We are very
24 appreciative of the opportunity to move
25 this project forward.

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING

2 We've been working very closely
3 with Supervisor D'Alessandro and the Town
4 of East Fishkill through a very
5 coordinated and comprehensive entitlement
6 process on behalf of Amazon for a new
7 build facility for them on the 123 acres
8 of the former IBM campus. We actually
9 just had attended a Town Board meeting
10 last evening where the project did
11 receive its neg dec, so we feel as though
12 we are in a good pattern to complete with
13 the entitlements in short order. And our
14 goal is to, soon after the weather breaks
15 in the new year, actually break ground
16 and realize the redevelopment of the site
17 that has long been lying fallow and I
18 think has been targeted for something
19 like this. And we're very happy to be
20 part of a true accomplishment for the
21 region.

22 THE HEARING OFFICER:

23 Thank you. Mr. Ryan or
24 Mr. Griggs, would you like to make any
25 statement? You're not required to, I'm

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 just asking if you would like.

3 MR. BOB RYAN:

4 This is Bob Ryan. I just want to
5 again reiterate the Applicant's
6 appreciation to the IDA for entertaining
7 this application for incentives to really
8 make this project come together and be a
9 successful project for the region.

10 MR. BRAD GRIGGS:

11 Similarly -- this is Brad Griggs,
12 I'm a Senior Manager on Amazon's Economic
13 Development Team. I just want to thank
14 the IDA Board, Executive Director Sarah
15 Lee, and Town Supervisor D'Alessandro on
16 this process, and working together on
17 hopefully making this into a very
18 successful project here in the Town of
19 East Fishkill and Dutchess County.

20 THE HEARING OFFICER:

21 Supervisor D'Alessandro, would you
22 like to make any statement for the
23 record?

24 MR. NICHOLAS D'ALESSANDRO:

25 Good morning, everyone. The Town

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 of East Fishkill is very excited about
3 this project coming to our town. Like
4 Mr. DiCola said, last night, they
5 received their neg dec and also their
6 special use permit from the Town Board.
7 We've been moving at lightning speed, and
8 I appreciate the IDA's assistance. I
9 appreciate the County's assistance. It's
10 going to be a tremendous project for the
11 region. So thank you all.

12 THE HEARING OFFICER:

13 Thank you. I'll move through in
14 the order in which the names are
15 appearing on my screen. Besides Laura,
16 our court reporter, Ryan Kelly is next.
17 Do you have anything you would like to
18 add to this?

19 MR. RYAN KELLY:

20 Just to thank the IDA for their
21 time this morning. We really appreciate
22 it.

23 THE HEARING OFFICER:

24 Thank you. I see Mike Bettini.
25 Would you like to make any statements?

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 You're muted. If you don't unmute, we'll
3 move on to the next person. I will move
4 on to the next person. Justice McCray,
5 would you like to be heard?

6 MR. JUSTICE McCRAY:

7 Yes, please.

8 THE HEARING OFFICER:

9 You're on.

10 MR. JUSTICE McCRAY:

11 Hi. Thank you all so much for
12 being here. I just have a couple of
13 thoughts. I'm a resident of Beacon, New
14 York.

15 Amazon is convenient. It's got
16 low prices and speedy direct delivery,
17 which I think everyone appreciates. And
18 I'm really excited for the promise of 500
19 new jobs. I think it's really great.
20 And in this economy, it's something
21 that's needed.

22 I do have a little bit of concern
23 about the jobs that it could potentially
24 take away. I am a heavy proponent of
25 change. I fully understand that just

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 because things are a certain way doesn't
3 mean that that's the way that they have
4 to be. And I do know that brick and
5 mortar stores are dying. However, as a
6 resident of Beacon, New York, I know that
7 they are the backbone of our local
8 economy. Beacon is a tourist town, and
9 while I believe that basing a community's
10 economy around tourism is fundamentally
11 flawed, Beacon's sales tax revenues are
12 what ultimately fund the services of
13 Dutchess County. Their sales tax is, of
14 the sales taxes in Dutchess County, are
15 41.1 percent of what Dutchess County's
16 budgeted revenue is. And this warehouse
17 would potentially obliterate Beacon's
18 economy, and I don't see that tax money
19 being replaced.

20 While Amazon makes billions of
21 dollars, which billions is truly --
22 trillions, I should say, rather -- truly
23 an unfathomable amount, they avoid paying
24 taxes at every turn. And the taxes they
25 do report and are paying are coming out

1
2 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
3 of employees' paychecks. So while I do
4 appreciate convenience and I don't see
5 myself styming any of this process at
6 all, frankly, all I want to see is an
7 equitable future built. And I can assure
8 you that my community, the community of
9 Beacon, will be there every step to build
10 an equitable foundation and make sure
11 that, as long as this process is
12 happening, that it is equitable in every
13 sense, every step of the way.

14 So if the 500 new jobs that Marc
15 Molinaro is projecting includes the loss
16 of all the local businesses that this is
17 going to take away from Beacon and other
18 towns in Dutchess County, then I hope --
19 sorry -- I hope that if the county is
20 endorsing this, that they're going to
21 ensure the safety of the employees that
22 are going to be at this new warehouse,
23 considering that in October of just this
24 year, over 19.8 thousand employees were
25 reported to have contracted COVID. And I
know for a fact that, when an employee

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 died in an Amazon warehouse, Amazon
3 workers were told to work around that
4 employee. And that's not the kind of
5 thing that I want to see built in my
6 community. I want to make sure that
7 whatever gets built here and is put here
8 is ensuring the safety, means, and needs
9 of people in our community that are going
10 to be working there.

11 If the county thinks that this is
12 the best thing for our community, then I
13 want to make sure that everything is
14 being done to prevent the exploitation of
15 the employees that are going to be there.
16 And I know my community feels the same.
17 If this is going to wipe out local
18 businesses and change the direction in
19 which our economy exists, which is -- you
20 know, looking toward the future's
21 great -- but if it's going to do that,
22 and if it's going to be making as much
23 money as Amazon does, there's no reason
24 for employees that are going to be
25 working there to have to rely on food

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 stamps or other taxpayer resources to get
3 by. If this warehouse comes to fruition,
4 it needs to be something that is paying
5 their employees and the people in our
6 communities a living wage.

7 I think this is a great idea. And
8 if the county can ensure that at least
9 \$500 million in tax revenue comes back to
10 us for our county schools, public
11 programs, and other services that folks
12 here need -- and \$500 million sounds like
13 a lot, but that's less than .001 percent
14 of their net worth, so I think they can
15 afford to funnel that much back into the
16 county. I think that's the minimum they
17 should be giving back to us if this is
18 something that's going to be happening
19 here. I don't think that a
20 trillion-dollar company needs to be given
21 any tax breaks should it be coming to our
22 community. And I really hope that, when
23 it does come, it really boosts our
24 schools, our public services, and
25 everything else that could ultimately

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 make our communities here in Dutchess
3 County better.

4 Like I said before, I appreciate
5 convenience and low prices, but I will
6 not trade that for the well-being of the
7 people in my community. So as long as
8 Amazon and the county knows that there
9 will be unionization and that this
10 community cares about its labor workers,
11 and that the county knows to -- or as
12 long as the county's not giving this
13 trillion-dollar company tax breaks, but
14 rather, using their tax revenue to give
15 independent business owners tax breaks to
16 ultimately boost our economy, then I
17 think that this is a great idea.

18 That is all I have to say. Thank
19 you so much for your time.

20 THE HEARING OFFICER:

21 Thank you for your comments.

22 Next. Mr. Beretta, you're next.

23 MR. JAMES BERETTA:

24 Good morning, Mr. Cappillino and
25 everybody else.

1
2 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
3 THE HEARING OFFICER:

4 I should begin by saying we did
5 receive your comments, and those comments
6 will be passed on to the IDA as well.

7 MR. JAMES BERETTA:

8 Thank you. So I'm opposed to the
9 financial assistance. Amazon is reported
10 to be a \$1.7 trillion corporation, and
11 they should pay the taxes.

12 Amazon is a wildly successful
13 company. That's great. I've been
14 following the company since Jeff Bezos
15 started selling books out of a small
16 warehouse with a concrete floor. And who
17 knew that anybody would buy a book online
18 if you couldn't touch it or feel it? So
19 I'm very familiar with the company, very
20 familiar with their success and
21 innovation. They can afford to pay their
22 taxes. \$1.7 trillion corporation. So
23 I'm opposed to the financial assistance.

24 Thank you.

25 THE HEARING OFFICER:

Thank you. I think, just for the

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 record, we should state that --

3 understand that on the IBM west campus
4 where this project's located, there are
5 obsolescent buildings, and this project
6 calls for the -- it's been that way,
7 vacant, I believe for over 20 years. And
8 I know that the IDA has been involved
9 over the years trying to attract
10 businesses there. And so the idea here
11 is simply that the Applicant here will
12 demolish the buildings and put one
13 large -- demolish three buildings, and
14 put one large warehouse there, and then
15 they'll begin paying taxes on this new
16 structure, but with a tax break that's
17 approved by the municipalities before the
18 IDA would consider it. And that's what's
19 being proposed here. So there will be
20 new tax revenues coming in, and the IDA
21 is aware of that.

22 Next, Rachel, would you allow
23 Doreen Tignanelli to speak? Thank you.

24 MS. DOREEN TIGNANELLI:

25 Hello. This is Doreen.

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING

2 Mr. Cappillino, I understand what
3 you just said, but the bottom line is,
4 Amazon is not going to be paying their
5 full share of taxes. While Mr. Griggs
6 thanked the IDA and local officials, he
7 failed to thank the local taxpayers who
8 will be picking up Amazon's share of the
9 taxes. So that should be recognized.

10 I'm also opposed to the issuance
11 of any financial assistance to the
12 project. It places an unfair burden on
13 local taxpayers. Amazon's a
14 trillion-dollar company whose owner is
15 the richest person in the world. And
16 Amazon does not need me or any other
17 taxpayers in the county to subsidize
18 their project.

19 Every project that comes before
20 the IDA seems to say the same thing.
21 They threaten that if they don't get the
22 financial assistance, they're going to go
23 elsewhere. Amazon is no different. They
24 said that without financial assistance,
25 they'll just utilize their current

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 centers in New York -- I'm sorry, New
3 Jersey, Pennsylvania, Connecticut. And
4 apparently, such tactics worked on the
5 IDA, because in the years that I've been
6 attending IDA meetings, the IDA has never
7 not approved a request for financial
8 assistance.

9 The material provided for the
10 public to review was lacking one
11 important piece of information, perhaps
12 most important piece. The application
13 did not provide a dollar figure for the
14 estimated property tax abatement amount.
15 It provided an amount for sales tax
16 exemption, mortgage tax exemption, but
17 the largest exemption lacked a dollar
18 figure. Instead, there was a nebulous
19 "TBD" -- for to be determined, I'm
20 assuming. And due to that lack of
21 transparency, the public is forced to
22 rely on the Poughkeepsie Journal, who
23 claimed on November 17th that the
24 property tax exemption was roughly
25 \$14.3 million. So again, that should

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 have been included in the materials
3 posted.

4 The claim was made that Amazon's
5 going to provide 500 jobs. Well, 500
6 jobs sounds good, but will those jobs
7 really be created? And while I know that
8 the IDA and their counsel -- every time I
9 bring this up, they cite the existence of
10 recapture or clawback provisions, meaning
11 that if the promised number of jobs
12 aren't created, then the tax incentives
13 could have to be repaid. But those
14 provisions are meaningless if the IDA is
15 not accurately tracking job numbers. And
16 an audit by the Dutchess County
17 Comptroller found in her September, 2018
18 report that there was no formal
19 monitoring process in place to ensure
20 accuracy of employment numbers, and that
21 in some cases, the number of jobs
22 certified by projects to the agency
23 didn't match what the agency was
24 reporting. So how are we supposed to
25 know if these 500 jobs really were

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 created? And chances are, we never will
3 know whether that's an accurate amount.
4 And the likelihood of them having to pay
5 back any money is probably slim to none.

6 I'll say it again, the Dutchess
7 County IDA appears to be
8 over-incentivizing projects. Again,
9 according to the Poughkeepsie Journal, in
10 a July 27, 2020 article entitled, "Local
11 IDAs Grant the Second Most Tax Breaks in
12 New York State," the Dutchess County IDA
13 gave out over \$22 million in tax
14 exemptions and only got back 1,400 jobs.
15 Contrast that with the Orange County IDA
16 that gave out almost half the amount,
17 \$12.6 million in tax breaks, and they got
18 6,500 jobs created. So again, for
19 whatever reason, this county IDA seems to
20 be more likely than other IDAs to be
21 influenced into granting higher amounts
22 of financial assistance. And I have no
23 doubt that this project will be
24 rubber-stamped like every other project
25 that goes before the IDA, but I still

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 believe that Amazon, with all of their
3 wealth, should be paying their tax in
4 full.

5 And I will be submitting these
6 comments in writing. Thank you.

7 THE HEARING OFFICER:

8 Thank you. Next. Nick Page, do
9 you wish to speak? I'll give you about
10 10 to 15 seconds to unmute. Okay. Not
11 having unmuted, we will move on to
12 Rebecca Edwards. Would you like to
13 speak? Please unmute.

14 MS. REBECCA EDWARDS:

15 Hi, how are you? Good to see you
16 this morning.

17 I'm wondering if I might pose a
18 question, since it's one place where we
19 have the opportunity to talk with people
20 directly with Amazon, which would be the
21 tenant. And that would be concerning
22 employment policies. One of the ways
23 that The Gap has been helpful as a
24 warehouse project in Dutchess County is
25 that they are open to hiring people who

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 may be on probation or who have just come
3 out of the criminal justice system. And
4 that's been valuable since these are
5 folks who are trying to get a new start,
6 a fresh beginning, and it's often
7 difficult for them to find employment.
8 And I'm wondering what Amazon's policies
9 are around the employment of folks who
10 may be on probation or have convictions
11 on their record who are trying to get a
12 new start.

13 THE HEARING OFFICER:

14 Well, you know, the public hearing
15 is really to listen to the public and
16 have the public make whatever comment
17 they have on the project. If you have a
18 question and would like to do that, I'm
19 willing, in these circumstances, to allow
20 someone to speak on behalf of the project
21 if they'd like. I believe that -- Mr.
22 Griggs, would you like to respond?

23 MR. BRAD GRIGGS:

24 Sure. So Amazon's hiring
25 practices, we're an inclusive, equal

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
2 opportunity employer throughout North
3 America. As part of our hiring process
4 and due diligence, the applicants submit
5 a written application, they go through an
6 interview process, and then they are
7 subject to a background check, and in
8 these times, a contactless drug test.
9 Part of the background check would be a
10 review of their prior history. We do not
11 necessarily disqualify people who have
12 potential criminal backgrounds. But that
13 is our proprietary hiring process. That
14 does include a background check as part
15 of it, but it is not exclusive of those
16 with criminal records.

17 MS. REBECCA EDWARDS:

18 Thank you.

19 THE HEARING OFFICER:

20 Anything else, Ms. Edwards?

21 MS. REBECCA EDWARDS:

22 No. Thank you.

23 THE HEARING OFFICER:

24 Thank you.

25 MS. SARAH LEE:

1 DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING

2 I think Supervisor D'Alessandro
3 wanted to make one last comment.

4 THE HEARING OFFICER:

5 Sure. Supervisor D'Alessandro,
6 please.

7 MR. NICHOLAS D'ALESSANDRO:

8 No, that's okay. My question was
9 answered. Thank you.

10 THE HEARING OFFICER:

11 Thank you. All right, with that,
12 since everyone's been given an
13 opportunity to speak -- and we thank you
14 for your participation, everyone. All of
15 this information from today's meeting is
16 being transcribed and will be provided to
17 the Board, along with the written
18 comments that Mr. Beretta has provided
19 and Ms. Tignanelli promises to provide.
20 And if anyone else wants to, they can
21 send an email to the Dutchess County IDA
22 offices, and provided they're timely
23 received, they will be transmitted as
24 promptly as possible to the Board so the
25 Board will have a full understanding of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

DUTCHESS COUNTY IDA PUBLIC HEARING
all the comments.

I thank you all. And with that, I
will close the public hearing. It is now
9:54 a.m. Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)
)SS:
COUNTY OF ORANGE)

I, LAURA EVANS, a Court Reporter and
Notary Public within and for the State of New
York, do hereby certify that the foregoing is
a true and correct transcript of the minutes
recorded by me and reduced to typewriting
under my supervision to the best of my
knowledge and ability.

X 

Laura Evans

	Bezos (1) 14:13	14:9,21	evening (1) 5:10	
\$	Board (2) 5:9;7:6	county (5) 12:8,10,16;16:17; 20:24	everyone (1) 3:3	H
\$1.7 (2) 14:9,21	book (1) 14:16	County's (1) 7:9	evidence (2) 3:13,19	happening (1) 12:18
\$500 (2) 12:9,12	books (1) 14:14	court (1) 7:16	excited (1) 7:2	happy (1) 5:19
A	boosts (1) 12:23	criminal (2) 22:12,16	exclusive (1) 22:15	HEARING (19) 3:2,4,6,7,8,9,10,12, 15,18,22;5:22;7:12, 23;14:2,24;20:7; 22:19,23
accomplishment (1) 5:20	bottom (1) 16:3	current (1) 16:25	Exhibit (3) 3:8,13,19	held (1) 3:11
acres (1) 5:7	break (1) 5:15	D	F	helpful (1) 20:23
actually (2) 5:8,15	breaks (2) 5:14;12:21	D'Alessandro (2) 3:23;5:3	facility (1) 5:7	Hi (1) 20:15
add (1) 7:18	build (1) 5:7	dec (2) 5:11;7:5	failed (1) 16:7	hiring (3) 20:25;22:3,13
affidavit (2) 3:13,19	burden (1) 16:12	DiCola (1) 7:4	fallow (1) 5:17	history (1) 22:10
afford (2) 12:15;14:20	buy (1) 14:16	different (1) 16:23	familiar (2) 14:18,19	Honorable (1) 3:23
Amazon (8) 5:6;14:8,11;16:4, 16,23;20:2,20	C	diligence (1) 22:4	feel (2) 5:11;14:17	hope (1) 12:22
Amazon's (2) 16:8,13	campus (1) 5:8	directly (1) 20:20	financial (5) 14:8,22;16:11,22, 24	I
America (1) 22:3	can (3) 12:8,14;14:20	disqualify (1) 22:11	Fishkill (3) 3:24;5:4;7:2	IBM (1) 5:8
appearing (1) 7:15	Cappillino (2) 3:4;16:2	Donald (1) 3:4	floor (1) 14:15	IDA (4) 7:20;14:5;16:6,20
applicants (1) 22:4	Carrion (1) 3:25	Dr (1) 3:25	folks (1) 12:11	IDA's (1) 7:8
application (1) 22:5	check (3) 22:7,9,14	drug (1) 22:8	following (1) 14:13	idea (1) 12:7
appreciate (3) 7:8,9,21	closely (1) 5:2	due (1) 22:4	former (1) 5:8	include (1) 22:14
assistance (7) 7:8,9;14:8,22; 16:11,22,24	coming (2) 7:3;12:21	Dutchess (1) 20:24	fruition (1) 12:3	indicating (3) 3:9,14,20
attended (1) 5:9	comments (3) 14:4,4;20:6	E	full (2) 16:5;20:4	innovation (1) 14:20
B	communities (1) 12:6	East (3) 3:24;5:4;7:2	funnel (1) 12:15	interview (1) 22:6
back (3) 12:9,15,17	community (1) 12:22	Edwards (5) 20:12,14;22:17,20, 21	G	into (1) 12:15
background (3) 22:7,9,14	company (5) 12:20;14:12,13,18; 16:14	else (2) 12:25;22:20	Gap (1) 20:23	issuance (1) 16:10
backgrounds (1) 22:12	complete (1) 5:12	elsewhere (1) 16:23	given (1) 12:20	J
began (1) 3:7	comprehensive (1) 5:5	employees (1) 12:5	giving (1) 12:17	JAMES (1) 14:6
begin (1) 14:3	concerning (1) 20:21	employer (1) 22:2	goal (1) 5:14	Jeff (1) 14:13
behalf (1) 5:6	concrete (1) 14:15	employment (1) 20:22	Good (3) 3:3;5:12;20:15	Jenna (1) 3:20
BERETTA (1) 14:6	contactless (1) 22:8	ensure (1) 12:8	great (2) 12:7;14:12	Jones (1) 3:20
Besides (1) 7:15	coordinated (1) 5:5	entitlement (1) 5:5	Griggs (2) 5:24;16:5	Jose (1) 3:25
Bettini (1) 7:24	copy (1) 3:21	entitlements (1) 5:13	ground (1) 5:15	Journal (1)
	corporation (2)			

3:16		Page (1) 20:8	realize (1) 5:16	small (1) 14:14
K	N	part (4) 5:20;22:3,9,14	really (3) 7:21;12:22,23	soon (1) 5:14
Kelly (2) 7:16,19	names (1) 7:14	passed (1) 14:5	Rebecca (4) 20:12,14;22:17,21	sounds (1) 12:12
knew (1) 14:16	necessarily (1) 22:11	pattern (1) 5:12	receive (2) 5:11;14:4	speak (2) 20:9,13
L	need (2) 12:12;16:16	pay (2) 14:10,20	received (1) 7:5	special (1) 7:6
last (2) 5:10;7:4	needs (2) 12:4,20	paying (3) 12:4;16:4;20:3	recognized (1) 16:9	speed (1) 7:7
Laura (1) 7:15	neg (2) 5:11;7:5	people (4) 12:5;20:19,25; 22:11	records (1) 22:16	stamps (1) 12:2
least (1) 12:8	net (1) 12:14	percent (1) 12:13	redevelopment (1) 5:16	started (1) 14:14
LEE (1) 22:25	new (2) 5:6,15	permit (1) 7:6	region (2) 5:21;7:11	statement (1) 5:25
less (1) 12:13	next (2) 7:16;20:8	person (1) 16:15	reported (1) 14:8	statements (1) 7:25
lightning (1) 7:7	Nicholas (1) 3:23	picking (1) 16:8	reporter (1) 7:16	subject (1) 22:7
line (1) 16:3	Nick (1) 20:8	place (1) 20:18	required (1) 5:25	submit (1) 22:4
living (1) 12:6	night (1) 7:4	places (1) 16:12	resources (1) 12:2	submitting (1) 20:5
local (3) 16:6,7,13	North (1) 22:2	Please (1) 20:13	revenue (1) 12:9	subsidize (1) 16:17
long (1) 5:17	notice (3) 3:9,14,21	policies (1) 20:22	review (1) 22:10	success (1) 14:19
lot (1) 12:13	November (2) 3:16,21	pose (1) 20:17	richest (1) 16:15	successful (1) 14:11
lying (1) 5:17	O	potential (1) 22:12	Ryan (3) 5:23;7:16,19	Superintendent (1) 3:25
M	OFFICER (10) 3:2,5;5:22;7:12,23; 14:2,24;20:7;22:19, 23	Poughkeepsie (1) 3:16	S	Supervisor (2) 3:24;5:3
mail (1) 3:22	Officer's (3) 3:8,12,18	prior (1) 22:10	same (1) 16:20	T
marked (3) 3:8,12,18	officials (1) 16:6	process (4) 5:6;22:3,6,13	SARAH (1) 22:25	talk (1) 20:19
matter (1) 3:5	one (2) 20:18,22	programs (1) 12:11	saying (1) 14:3	targeted (1) 5:18
meeting (1) 5:9	online (1) 14:16	project (7) 5:10;7:3,10;16:12, 18,19;20:24	schools (2) 12:10,24	tax (3) 12:9,21;20:3
might (1) 20:17	open (1) 20:25	proprietary (1) 22:13	screen (1) 7:15	taxes (4) 14:10,21;16:5,9
Mike (1) 7:24	opening (1) 3:5	public (8) 3:6,7,9,10,15,22; 12:10,24	seconds (1) 20:10	taxpayer (1) 12:2
million (2) 12:9,12	opportunity (2) 20:19;22:2	publication (1) 3:14	seems (1) 16:20	taxpayers (3) 16:7,13,17
minimum (1) 12:16	opposed (3) 14:7,22;16:10	published (1) 3:15	selling (1) 14:14	tenant (1) 20:21
morning (3) 3:3;7:21;20:16	order (2) 5:13;7:14	Q	served (1) 3:22	test (1) 22:8
move (2) 7:13;20:11	out (1) 14:14	question (1) 20:18	services (2) 12:11,24	thanked (1) 16:6
moving (1) 7:7	owner (1) 16:14	R	share (2) 16:5,8	though (1) 5:11
much (1) 12:15	P	R	short (1) 5:13	threaten (1) 16:21
			site (1) 5:16	throughout (1) 22:2

times (1) 22:8	16:15			
today (1) 3:11	worth (1) 12:14			
touch (1) 14:17	writing (1) 20:6			
Town (5) 3:24;5:3,9;7:3,6	written (1) 22:5			
tremendous (1) 7:10	Y			
trillion (2) 14:9,21	year (1) 5:15			
trillion-dollar (2) 12:20;16:14	Z			
true (1) 5:20	Zoom (1) 3:10			
U	0			
ultimately (1) 12:25	001 (1) 12:13			
understand (1) 16:2	1			
unfair (1) 16:12	1 (1) 3:8			
unmute (2) 20:10,13	10 (1) 20:10			
unmuted (1) 20:11	123 (1) 5:7			
up (1) 16:8	15 (1) 20:10			
upon (2) 3:22,24	2			
use (1) 7:6	2 (1) 3:13			
utilize (1) 16:25	20 (1) 3:16			
W	2020 (1) 3:17			
wage (1) 12:6	20th (1) 3:21			
warehouse (3) 12:3;14:15;20:24	3			
ways (1) 20:22	3 (1) 3:19			
wealth (1) 20:3	9			
weather (1) 5:14	9:30 (2) 3:11,11			
whose (1) 16:14				
wildly (1) 14:11				
wish (1) 20:9				
without (1) 16:24				
wondering (1) 20:17				
working (1) 5:2				
world (1)				

From: [Jim Beretta](#)
To: [Sarah Lee](#)
Subject: Public Hearing Comments, for USEF Tioranda, LLC and Amazon.com Services LLC
Date: Thursday, December 03, 2020 5:06:25 PM

I wish to submit the following public comments for the December 4, 2020 public hearing for the financial assistance request from the project proposed by USEF Tioranda, LLC and [Amazon.com](#) Services LLC.

I am opposed to the financial assistance requested for the project proposed by USEF Tioranda, LLC and [Amazon.com](#) Services LLC:

1. Amazon is reported to be a \$1.7 Trillion corporation and they should be able to pay their taxes.
2. There is no business case provided that demonstrates that this project is not economically feasible without financial assistance.
3. When development projects don't pay their taxes the burden is shifted to other taxpayers. Especially during this time of the COVID-19 pandemic, governments and municipalities have gaps in their budgets and absolving some from paying taxes is antithetical to the gaps in municipal budgets and fairness for all other taxpayers.
4. Millions of people in the country are facing unemployment and the lack of ability to put food on the table for their family. All taxes should be collected from for-profit, non-tax-exempt projects.
6. Right here in the Hudson Valley, a recent article in the Poughkeepsie Journal pointed out that "**38% of Hudson Valley households struggle to make ends meet**". I reference that article below:

Poughkeepsie Journal article by Ryan Santistvan, August 12, 2020.

"ALICE report shows 38% of Hudson Valley households struggle to make ends meet"

" Amid the COVID-19 pandemic, unemployment across the region and state has soared. But even before that, roughly 38% of Hudson Valley households and 45% of households across the state were not making enough money to cover their basic needs, according to the United Way of New York. And, those numbers were disproportionately higher when looking only at black and hispanic households.

7. Dutchess County is experiencing financial budget gaps due to the COVID-19 pandemic, having to furlough employees, offer early retirement and take other spending cuts to try and meet the financial challenge. The County can ill afford to be providing tax exemptions. As quoted in the following referenced article, Dutchess County is at the top of the list, "statewide", for sales tax loss, so far, in 2020 and the County Executive "was projecting 50% less revenue in sales tax this year amid the pandemic."

Rockland/Westchester Journal News, May 12, 2020, David McKay Wilson

"Dutchess County had the biggest year-to-year sales tax decline statewide in March, with a loss of 17%, as popular restaurants shifted to take-out, and tourists stayed home. April was even worse, with sales taxes revenue down 27%. For the first four months of 2020, Dutchess sales tax receipts are down \$4.5 million, or 7%. Last month, Dutchess County Executive Marc Molinaro said the county was projecting 50% less revenue in sales tax this year amid the pandemic. The restoration "I daresay, is going to last through the duration of 2020," he said. "

Again, I am opposed to the financial assistance being requested.

Jim Beretta
Poughkeepsie
845-392-6252

From: [Doreen Tiganelli](#)
To: [Sarah Lee](#)
Subject: Public Comment, USEF Tioranda LLC & Amazon.Com Services LLC DCIDA Public Hearing, December 4, 2020
Date: Friday, December 04, 2020 9:44:10 AM

Ms. Lee, please include my comments as part of the official public record for the 9:30 am December 4, 2020 DCIDA Public Hearing regarding the USEF Tioranda, LLC and Amazon.Com Services LLC project and share these comments with the DCIDA Chair and Board members.

1) I am opposed to the issuance of "Financial Assistance" to the USEF Tioranda, LLC and Amazon.Com Services LLC Project in any form including, but not limited to, Mortgage Tax Exemption, Sales Tax Exemption and Payment in Lieu of Taxes (PILOT) as it places an unnecessary burden on local taxpayers.

2) Amazon is a trillion dollar company whose owner is the richest person in the world. Amazon does not need a tax break subsidized by taxpayers. Every project that comes before the IDA seems to threaten the same thing, that without financial assistance from the IDA, the project will not go forward or that it will go elsewhere. Amazon is no different, saying that without financial assistance they will utilize their current centers in NJ, PA, CT, etc. Such tactics apparently work on the Dutchess County IDA. In the year that I have been attending DCIDA meetings, the IDA has never *not* approved any request for Financial Assistance.

3) Material provided for the public's review is lacking an important piece of information, perhaps the most important piece. In the "Application for Financial Assistance", no dollar figure is provided for the Estimated Property Tax Abatement the project is to receive. The Estimated Sales Tax Exemption amount of around \$2.5 million is stated as well as the Estimated Mortgage Tax Exemption of around half a million dollars, but the largest exemption, the Estimated Property Tax Abatement, lacks a dollar figure, instead stating a nebulous "TBD". Due to the lack of transparency, the public is forced to rely on the Poughkeepsie Journal's November 17, 2020 claim that *"The 15-year PILOT would create an estimate real property tax exemption of roughly \$14.3 million for the duration of the agreement."*

4) The claim is made that 500 jobs will be created but often times job creation numbers promised by applicants are inaccurate or jobs fail to materialize. The DCIDA and their counsel frequently cite the existence of recapture/clawback provisions, meaning if the promised number of jobs are not created, tax incentives could have to be repaid. However, these provisions are meaningless if the IDA is not ensuring the accuracy of job numbers.

Inaccuracy of IDA job numbers was noted in Dutchess County Comptroller Robin Lois' findings in her September 2018 LDC/IDA Audit Report stating *"there is no formal monitoring process in place to ensure the accuracy of employment numbers submitted to the agency by project representatives"* and *"In some cases the number of jobs certified by projects to the respective agency did not match what was reported"*

to the Authorities Budget Office through the annual PARIS filing".

5) The Dutchess County IDA appears to be over-incentivizing projects. According to a July 27, 2020 front-page Poughkeepsie Journal article entitled "Local IDAs grant second-most tax breaks in state", the Dutchess County IDA provided \$22.6 million in net tax exemptions with 1,404 jobs created. Contrast that with the Orange County IDA that provided \$12.6 million in net tax exemptions with 6,511 jobs created according to the article.

Perhaps the Dutchess County IDA is more likely than other IDAs to be influenced into granting higher amounts of financial assistance.

Doreen A. Tignanelli
29 Colburn Drive
Poughkeepsie NY 12603